

19

THE TEXTURE OF SPACE

Desire and displacement in Hiroshi Teshigahara's *Woman of the dunes* [*Suna no onna*]

Matthew Gandy

Writing about film is a little like writing about music: it is difficult to translate a sensory experience into something other than itself. In a sense, however, all writing is a process of translation though the degree to which we might recognize these limitations varies from one context to another. To convey the experience of landscape directly, for example, is very different from engaging with depictions of landscape in cinema, literature or music. Cinema presents geographers with an especially rich means to explore the concept of landscape in terms of its lineage to other forms of aesthetic representation and also through the cinematic experience itself as a critical element in modern culture. The creative possibilities for the exploration of landscape in film emerged with the earliest experimental footage from rooftops and moving trains and gradually encompassed ever more ambitious attempts to extend the scope of human sensory experience. The cinematic landscape poses questions at the heart of cultural geography: the tension between phenomenological and materialist readings of space; the changing relationship between technology, aesthetics and modern consciousness; and the role of cinema as a repository of collective memory. Cinema should not be read as a mere cipher for pre-given theoretical assumptions or seen as purely illustrative of a set of predetermined cultural positions. An open engagement with film promises no less than the revitalization of cultural geography and its intersecting conceptual terrains.

One of the most striking cinematic explorations of landscape is provided by Hiroshi Teshigahara's *Woman of the dunes* [*Suna no onna*] (1964) which focuses on two people trapped at the bottom of a deep sand pit located in a desolate stretch of dunes. These shifting dunes – which are ominously described in Kôbô Abe's original novel as “bathed in a murky reddishness” – dominate the metaphorical and iconographic structure of the film.¹ *Woman of the dunes* is an intricate collaboration between the director Hiroshi Teshigahara (1927–2001), the avant-garde novelist and playwright Kôbô Abe (1924–93), who wrote the screenplay adapted from his

own novel, and the experimental composer Tōru Takemitsu (1930–96). This “cinematic collective,” which made a series of films in the 1960s, is very different from the auteurist legacy associated with other Japanese film makers such as Yasujiro Ozu, Kenji Mizoguchi or Akira Kurosawa.² Their first major collaborative project was the film *Pitfall* [*Otooshiana*] (1961), which is set in and around an abandoned mine, and includes extensive footage of former industrial landscapes. With the completion of *Woman in the dunes* their work became part of an internationally recognized “new wave” in Japanese cinema that marked a break from the classic era of Japanese film making in the 1950s and opened up new connections with modernist culture in Europe and North America.

I. The dunes

The opening sequence of the film creates an atmosphere of dissonance and disorientation: complex visual patterns are set to a collage of street sounds mixed with experimental music. The images range from finger print swirls and twisting map contours to clusters of official rubber stamps. The enlarged edges of calligraphy brush strokes reveal yet more intricate features created by the fine spray of ink or stray brush hairs so that the transformative effects of scale are repeatedly emphasized. After the elaborate credit sequence we switch to an image of a highly magnified individual grain of sand that resembles a partially hatched egg; then through a series of steps we zoom out, at each stage revealing a different topographic effect, until we see the man (played by Eiji Okada) for the first time entering the frame from the bottom of the screen (Figure 19.1). As the man walks across the frame he leaves a trail of footprints in the sand and the camera lingers on these transitory traces so that the scale is rendered uncertain; the line of shallow indentations might be very large or very small, something created by an insect or perhaps a vast imprint on a distant planet.

This man is a teacher who is also an amateur entomologist hoping to discover a new species of beetle during his brief vacation in order to leave some kind of trace of his own existence for scientific posterity. He stumbles along in the mid-day heat like one of the beetles he is studying; his rucksack packed with entomological equipment resembling a spiky carapace attached to his back. The strangeness of nature is emphasized with close-ups of insects such as a caterpillar crawling across the hot sand or a dragonfly head with its iridescent compound eyes. As the light begins to change, the man comes across a village lying in the dunes. “What a terrible place to live,” he declares, as he peers down at the cluster of small houses.

Some local villagers approach the man, and after setting aside their suspicions that he might be a government inspector, invite him to stay as a guest in their village, adding a sense of anthropological intrigue to his entomological reverie. He condescendingly remarks how he would like to stay in “such a village” and reflects dreamily on the limitations of his life back in Tokyo where “certificates are limitless” – not unlike grains of sand. He is led to the top of a ridge and descends unsteadily down a rope ladder to a ramshackle dwelling that is surrounded by steep



FIGURE 19.1 ‘Woman of the dunes [Suna no onna]’, 1964. Courtesy of the British Film Institute, London (BFI Picture Number: bfi-00n-ili)

cliffs of sand. “It’s really quite an adventure,” he chuckles to himself, in one of the darkly humorous uses of dramatic irony that punctuate the early part of the film. The owner is a young woman (played by Kyoko Kishida), who explains that she has lived alone since her family were lost in a sand storm. Every surface in the cramped dwelling is covered with a fine layer of sand and there is an absence of even simple screens or partitions. Over dinner she describes unusual properties of the sand which can rot any material but her words are met by his rationalist incredulity. They cheerfully discuss the characteristics of insects that live in the shack and there is a sudden close-up a boiled fish head with bulging eyes. After dinner he busies himself pinning the day’s insects into neatly arranged rows as if to emphasize his meticulous mastery of these small co-inhabitants of the dunes. Light, shadow and scale are used continuously to play on our perception so that at times we cannot be sure what is being shown. In a dream-like sequence the cinematography superimposes different patterns such as the ribs of an umbrella, shifting sand formations and ultimately the woman’s body in profile.

II. The erotics of confinement

The next morning the man awakes to find that the woman is still sleeping: naked except for a cloth across her face. The covering of her face radically accentuates her nakedness and a light dusting of sand has transformed her body into a landscape. He quietly leaves the hut and emerges into the glaring sunlight to find that the rope ladder has gone: the camera pans across the steep sides of the pit and there is an ominous shuddering and falling of sand. After the woman has dressed he confronts her about their predicament and she explains that unless the sand is constantly removed then the entire village will be lost: she is one of a number of captive workers kept in pits who must shovel sand every day to protect the village from the advancing dunes. The landscape that had at first seemed merely a focus for his curiosity is now suddenly menacing and overwhelming in its grasp. The man realizes that he has been lured into a trap to be used as slave labour on behalf of the village and begins a series of desperate attempts to escape. His demands to be released are met by laughter from the villagers who periodically peer into the pit or drop food, water and other supplies for their captive workers. He tries tying up the woman to prevent her from working in order to endanger the stability of the dunes and force some kind of negotiation with their captors but all is to no avail. After he unties her, their existence becomes more intense, with close-ups of her fingers while eating and his unshaven throat gulping water. "Are you living to clear sand, or clearing sand to live," he asks. "If there were no sand, no one would bother about me," she replies. Their relationship becomes increasingly corporeal so that the cleaning of sand off each other's bodies leads to their first anguished sexual pleasure; the striations of soap across the man's back resemble the rippled surface of dunes as she scrapes her hands across his body (Figure 19.2).

He makes another, this time successful, attempt at escape by hurling a makeshift pickaxe attached to a rope only to be chased by the villagers into treacherous quick-sands from which he is rescued and despatched back to the pit. The woman reveals that the sand taken from the dunes is sold illegally for construction purposes but the likelihood that such buildings would collapse is of no interest to her: her confinement precludes any consideration of distant others just as society has no interest in her own plight. The abandonment of the village to poverty and the forces of nature has fostered an indifference toward the outside world that is shared by both the woman and her captors. In the novel, the man notes that although he now finds the landscape "nauseous," "there was no reason to think of life in the holes and the beauty of the landscape as being opposed to each other."³ Both the film and the novel explore the absence of any apparent contradiction between the touristic gaze – exemplified by the man's entomological fascination with the dunes – and the inescapable poverty facing its human inhabitants so that a counter-pastoral drama unfolds through the demystification of both the landscape and its people.

Their situation then takes on a more sinister dimension. The man asks the villagers if he might be allowed an occasional glimpse of the sea but they tell him after consulting among themselves that he must first have sex with the woman in



FIGURE 19.2 ‘Woman of the dunes [Suna no onna]’, 1964. Courtesy of the British Film Institute, London (BFI Picture Number: bfi-00m-zfu)

public. A large crowd of villagers assemble with drums and menacing *nō* masks that suggest a pre-modern Japan. Frenetic *onigoroshi daiko* [demon-killing drums] are used to instil a sense of dread through the creation of a violently repetitive soundscape.⁴ The humiliation of this scene connects with a sense of brooding political unease as if the outcast community has begun to turn on itself through acts of public retribution. He drags the woman from the house but eventually gives up on his attempted rape and the spectators, who include women, drift away from the pitiful scene. After this incident the passage of time becomes more attenuated and uncertain: the woman becomes ill and is taken away for medical treatment but the man chooses to stay in their pit and continue a series of “scientific investigations” to explore the unusual water-retaining properties of the sand. Most strikingly, the rope ladder is simply left in place after the hurried rescue of the woman and the man wanders around the dunes before returning to the pit that has now become his world. Both the novel and the film produce a temporal displacement from minutes to years: at the end of the film it is revealed that the man has been absent for seven years and is now officially classified as a “missing person.”

The film brings together two different kinds of captivity: the teacher from Tokyo who is stifled within his bureaucratic environs and the woman trapped within an even more terrifying form of physical, economic, emotional and sexual confinement.

Modern Japan is presented as a spiral of entrapment: the man is caught within a faceless society that regards its workers as little more than automatons whilst the woman represents a lonely outcast from Japan's post-war miracle. With her dark complexion and marginal existence the woman might also symbolize one of Japan's reviled *bura-kumin* or "untouchable" caste who were historically relegated to the dirtiest and most dangerous tasks but now eke out their living at the edge of modern society.⁵

III. Collage and repetition

The idea of nature presented in *Woman of the dunes* can be read as existential in the sense that nature is portrayed as a presence that is devoid of any pre-given meaning beyond its own expansion and replication.⁶ Implicit within this framework is the porosity of any clearly defined boundary between human and non-human life. At first, the man cannot understand what sustains the woman's struggle for existence and he feels a mix of pity and contempt for her. Yet his Sisyphean struggle to leave the pit becomes a measure of the indifference of nature to human endeavour just as the growing eroticism of his confinement presages his reconnection to the innate corporeality of human existence.

Much of the critical discourse surrounding the film has oscillated between two poles: on the one hand, an emphasis on the putative universalism of its existential themes; and on the other hand, a search for essential elements of a Japanese aesthetic sensibility.⁷ This dichotomy masks, however, the historical specificity of existential ideas within European thought and also the innate hybridity of Japanese cultural forms preceding the growing influence of international modernism in the 1950s.⁸ To say that the film is influenced by existential themes in literature and philosophy is not to say that the cinematic insights are universalist in their scope but rather internationalist in both their inspiration and orientation. *Woman of the dunes* brings together two somewhat disparate strands of existential thought: one the one hand, a set of ideas developed by Heidegger, Husserl and Merleau-Ponty, for example, on the corporeal dimensions to human subjectivity; and on the other hand, an avowedly atheistic position, associated with Sartre and especially Camus, concerned with the innate absurdity of existence.⁹

The emphasis on scale, process and transformation connects between the rippling surface of the dunes and the claustrophobic eroticism of the human relationship in the pit. The relentless movement and destructive power of the sand also signals the closeness of death in the midst of life to produce an erotics of sexual defiance (Figure 19.3).¹⁰ "The beauty of sand, in other words, belonged to death," writes Abe. "It was the beauty of death that ran through the magnificence of its ruins and its great power of destruction," just as the fine lines or blemishes on the skin of the human captives presages the inevitability of death.¹¹

The film develops Kafkaesque themes of entrapment, metamorphosis and repetition that are also extensively developed in Abe's other plays and novels.¹² The focus on insects raises questions of scale, movement and perception: how do these insects experience the landscape and what difference is there between the man and his



FIGURE 19.3 ‘Woman of the dunes [Suna no onna]’, 1964. Courtesy of the British Film Institute, London (BFI Picture Number: Picture Number: bfi-00o-0j9)

entomological prey? What, after all, really separates the human and non-human denizens of the dunes? The man’s transformation into little more than a human insect and the incongruity of his presence is emphasized by the growing oddity of his surroundings. The unusual landscapes portrayed in *Woman of the dunes* are different from the more usual depictions of nature in Japanese art that have tended toward a flattened or two-dimensional perspective. Traditional forms of landscape art such as *emaki* [scroll paintings] or *shōji* [painted panels] have been dominated by mountains, water and other features with strong symbolic associations.¹³ By contrast, the emphasis on dunes, which are marked by a paradoxical combination of emptiness, complexity and apparent formlessness, is a significant break with traditional modes of Japanese landscape art, and underlies the interconnection between *Woman of the dunes* and the modernist avant-garde. The emerging significance of the “formless” within abstract expressionism would have been familiar to Teshigahara both from his documentary film making in New York in 1959 and also from exhibitions in Japan.¹⁴

The music also provides connections with modernism through Takemitsu’s abstract soundscapes which draw influences from Cage, Ligeti, Messiaen and a myriad of other strands of twentieth-century music. As if to underlie the cinematic possibilities of his work, Takemitsu referred to his music as a “picture scroll unrolled.”¹⁵ Takemitsu’s connections to the modernist avant-garde also stem from

his role in the *Jikken Kōbō* [experimental workshop] which drew together a circle of artists, writers and others in the 1950s.¹⁶

Woman of the dunes presents a modernist collage that is hybrid in its origin and also in its object of critique: the film is suffused with aesthetic and political dissonance involving not only a rejection of the authoritarian legacy of Japanese imperialism and social conservatism but also the intolerance of the Left toward dissent: Abe, for example, had been expelled from the Japanese Communist Party in 1956 for “Trotskyist deviance” and both he and Teshigahara were members of organizations for progressive artists and film makers such as “Cinema 58” and the “Century Club.”¹⁷

The experimental impulse behind the film parallels other contemporary directors such as Yasuzo Masimura and Nagisa Oshima who played a leading role in bringing Japanese cinema to international audiences. Although the film won a Special Jury Prize at Cannes (and even received two Oscar nominations) it was not initially well received in Japan: the casting of Kyoko Kishida, for example, riled some Japanese audiences through her untypical facial features and the sex scenes were regarded by some critics as pornographic.¹⁸ Outside Europe, the film’s overt eroticism, minimalist structure and oblique aesthetics divided opinion: critics who perceived significant parallels with experimental European cinema, particularly the French new wave, were enthusiastic whilst other reactions were marked by varying degrees of anti-intellectual or anti-modern sentiments.¹⁹ Revealingly, the opening credits, which appear as spaces between “ripped” paper, are provided in Japanese, English and French, making explicit the film’s intended international audience.

IV. Naked landscapes

The use of dunes as a setting for the modern nude is a motif that connects the late expressionist art of painters such as Otto Mueller and Max Pechstein through to the photography of Edward Weston and Gerhard Vetter. Unlike the familiar ensembles of nature and nudity expressed in classical and religious allegory, dunes offered a more secular *tabula rasa* within which to explore the aesthetic characteristics of the human body in a natural setting.²⁰ The shift of emphasis from lakes or pools to the sea itself and its surrounding landscapes also marked a different kind of engagement with nature as a source of leisure rather than contrived eroticism. Though artists such as Mueller and Pechstein include both male and female figures in their landscapes, the overwhelming emphasis has been on the juxtaposition of nature with the female body. Female artists in the twentieth century such as Georgia O’Keefe and Ana Mendieta have sought to subvert or sequester representational associations between space, landscape and gender but the film *Woman of the dunes*, despite its fleeting male nudity, remains firmly rooted in the classical lineage of compositional associations between the iconographies of nature and idealized representations of the female body. Yet to reduce *Woman of the dunes* to no more than an intriguing footnote within the dominant aesthetic traditions that permeate the modernist avant-garde risks limiting a critical evaluation of the film.²¹

The depiction of the human body in *Woman of the dunes* tends toward a more ambiguous exploration of gender and sexuality than is apparent in most other films of the early 1960s. In the novel, Abe describes how the man feels as if someone had “borrowed his body” during sex, so that “Sex, of its nature, was not defined by a single, individual body but by the species.”²² Sex is treated not as a romantic path to “completeness” but rather as a form of generic repetition that is an inescapable impulse little different from eating or sleeping. The “anti-romantic” films of Hiroshi Teshigahara, Ōshima Nagisa, Imamura Shōhei and others mark a significant break with the dominance of highly restrictive codes of sexual representation in Japanese cinema. Yet the very success of such films opened up ambiguous commonalities between art-house erotica – the so-called *nikutai eiga* [film of the flesh] – and the more mainstream exploitative *pinku eiga* [pink cinema] emerging in the 1970s.²³

Whilst the pit within which the man is trapped might in crude psychoanalytic terms be read as a form of symbolic emasculation there is also a sense in which the man’s submission to the woman’s sexual needs is ultimately liberating. Certainly, the novel suggests that the man has become impotent in Tokyo and only rediscovers his sexual desire in captivity. The chaotic intensity of their forced union partially displaces some of the historically produced gender roles that have stifled freedom of expression in Japanese society. Yet the apparent “primitivism” of the woman’s sexuality and the “exoticism” of the semi-arid landscapes evoke a tension between an imaginary source of sexual authenticity and the possibility for female sexuality to be regarded as historically contested. The association of nature, landscape and eroticism also connects with significant counter-currents within the history of modern sexual politics that situate the body–nature nexus as a site of resistance toward social mores or the commercial exploitation of sexuality. Yet even if the subject matter can be interpreted as socially liberating in the context of the early 1960s the presence of a gendered cinematic apparatus creates new and unresolved complexities in the relationship of the body, space and power.

Final traces

“There will be as many interpretations as there are spectators,” remarked an American reviewer on seeing the film in 1964.²⁴ The “new wave” of Japanese cinema that emerged in the early 1960s is marked by a dense meshwork of cultural elements which link between the specific context of a post-war society in a state of flux and engagements with international aspects of modernist thought at the precise moment of its radical de-centring. In this respect the history of modernism can be read as a series of pulses of creativity emanating outwards from cities such as Paris and New York but becoming progressively fainter by the 1960s so that the teleological impulse of high modernism becomes gradually mixed with counter-currents emerging from Buenos Aires, Tokyo and elsewhere: the modernist movement during this period becomes an increasingly disparate and polycentric synthesis before its radical implosion and retrenchment in subsequent decades.²⁵

Woman of the dunes is derived from a creative synergy that blurs individual authorship. In this respect the production of the film – despite its international orientation – is rooted in more collaborative modes of cultural production than has been associated with the archetypal figure of the director in Europe or North America. At the same time, however, the film's abstract handling of cinematic space finds parallels with cinematic modernism in Michelangelo Antonioni's *Il deserto rosso* (1964) and Alain Resnais's *Année dernière à Marienbad* (1961).

There is a precision in which both the novel and the film evoke the fatalistic entanglement between the main protagonists and the comical parallels drawn with the insect fauna in the dunes. This emphasis on detail – not unlike the novels of Nabokov or Proust – tends to deflect the possibility for any straightforward interpretation. In Nabokov's essays on literature he offers a fierce resistance to interpretation as a form of allegorical generalization and makes a case for the essential separateness of art – not in terms of its putative autonomy à la Adorno but rather through an obligation to recognize the incommensurability of artistic production with everyday discourse.²⁶ There is a private domain of the imagination that resists compromise or categorization and a public realm where different systems of syntactical logic prevail.²⁷ But films have an intended audience who are themselves involved in the production of meaning along with the shifting contours of critical interpretation over time. In Nabokov's reading of Kafka, for example, he fiercely resists the possibility of allegorical or psychoanalytical interpretation, stating that “the abstract symbolic value of an artistic achievement should never prevail over its beautiful burning life.”²⁸ Yet *Woman of the dunes* is both idiosyncratic and symbolic; it is framed by its own simple narrative and yet strongly allegorical, whether we choose to read the work simply in terms of its own context or sketch connections with a panoply of wider themes. Contra Nabokov, can we not retain the subtlety of detail – the texture of space – and also engage with recurring motifs of human experience?

Notes

- 1 K. Abe, *The Woman in the Dunes*, trans. E.D. Saunders, London: Penguin, 2006 [1964], p. 174.
- 2 See M. Wada-Marciano, “Ethnicizing the Body and Film: Teshigahara Hiroshi's *Woman in the Dunes* (1964),” in A. Phillips and J. Stringer (eds), *Japanese Cinema: Texts and Contexts*, London: Routledge, 2007, pp. 180–92.
- 3 Abe, *The Woman in the Dunes*, p. 182.
- 4 P. Grilli, “Teshigahara and Takemitsu: Collaborations in Sight and Sound,” essay accompanying the British Film Institute's release of *Woman of the Dunes* in 2007.
- 5 D. Mitchell, “Introduction,” in K. Abe, *The Woman in the Dunes*, pp. v–xiii.
- 6 On the development of existential thought see, for example, P. Roubiczek, *Existentialism: For and Against*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1964.
- 7 See M. Wada-Marciano, “Ethnicizing the Body and Film.”
- 8 See S. Tadao, “Japanese Cinema and the Traditional Arts: Imagery, Technique, and Cultural Context,” in L. Ehrlich and D. Desser (eds), *Cinematic Landscapes: Observations on the Visual Arts and Cinema of China and Japan*, Austin: University of Texas Press, pp. 165–86. The cultural exchanges have also been significant in other fields such as architecture. See A. Isozaki, *Japan-ness in Architecture*, Cambridge: The MIT Press, 2006.

- 9 For contrasting examples of existential thought see, for example, M. Merleau-Ponty, *Nature: Course Notes from the Collège de France*, trans. R. Vallier, Evanston: Northwestern University, 2003 [1995]; and A. Camus, *Le mythe de Sisyphe*, Gallimard, 1942.
- 10 On the relationship between eros and death see, for example, J. Laplanche, *Life and Death in Psychoanalysis*, trans. J. Mehlman, Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1976 [1970].
- 11 Abe, *The Woman in the Dunes*, p. 183.
- 12 See, for example, M. Mariotti, "La donna di sabbia (Suna no onna)," *Cineforum* 474, 2008, 90.
- 13 T. Rimer, "Film and the Visual Arts in Japan: An Introduction," in L. Ehrlich and D. Desser (eds), *Cinematic Landscapes: Observations on the Visual Arts and Cinema of China and Japan*, Austin: University of Texas Press, pp. 149–54.
- 14 On the significance of the "formless" in modernism see Y.A. Bois and R.E. Krauss, *Formless: A User's Guide*, New York: Zone Books, 1997.
- 15 Cited in A. Ross, *The Rest is Noise: Listening to the Twentieth Century*, London: Fourth Estate, p. 517.
- 16 Grilli, "Teshigahara and Takemitsu."
- 17 See R. Koehler, "Three Films by Hiroshi Teshigahara," *Cineaste* 33, Winter 2007, 77–9; and D. Toop, *Haunted Weather: Music, Silence and Memory*, London: Serpent's Tail, 2004.
- 18 R. Bergan, "Kyoko Kishida: Obituary," *The Guardian*, 8 February 2007. Kishida had garnered a reputation for controversial roles through films such as Yasuzo Masumura's *Manji* (1964) where she plays a bored housewife who has a female lover. The screenplay for *Manji* was provided by another newly emerging director Kaneto Shindo whose widely acclaimed *Onibaba* (1964) uses a desolate late-mediaeval landscape of reeds as a setting for his exploration of sexual jealousy.
- 19 Some reviews, particularly in Britain, were quite dismissive of Teshigahara's "esoteric" cinematic vision. See, for example, I. Quigly, "Overcome by Sand," *Spectator*, 7 May 1965.
- 20 M. Faass, "Utopie: Lichtgestalten in der Landschaft," in W. Hornbostel and N. Jockel (eds), *Nackt: Die Ästhetik der Blöße*, Munich: Prestel, 2002, pp. 127–36; C. Remm, "Otto Muellers Akte in der Natur," in M.M. Moeller (ed.), *Auf der Suche nach dem Ursprünglichen: Mensch und Natur im Werk von Otto Mueller und den Künstlern der Brücke*, Munich: Hirmer, 2004, pp. 9–26.
- 21 A similar line of argument in relation to Renoir is developed by L. Nochlin, *Bathers, Bodies, Beauty: The Visceral Eye*, Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2006.
- 22 Abe, *The Woman in the Dunes*, p. 142.
- 23 I. Standish, *A New History of Japanese Cinema: A Century of Narrative*, New York: Continuum, 2005.
- 24 R. Gertner, "Woman in the Dunes," *Motion Picture Herald* 232, 11 November 1964, 10.
- 25 On the fading of modernism see P. Anderson, *The Origins of Postmodernity*, London: Verso, 1998.
- 26 V. Nabokov, *Lectures on Literature*, San Diego, Harcourt, 1980.
- 27 R. Rorty, *Contingency, Irony, and Solidarity*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989.
- 28 Nabokov, *Lectures on Literature*, p. 283.